

The Quattrocento Calvary from Catalonia at the Bilbao Fine Arts Museum

An outline of the artistic context



Cèsar Favà Monllau

**BILBOKO ARTE
EDERREN MUSEOA
MUSEO DE BELLAS
ARTES DE BILBAO**

This text is published under an international Attribution-NonCommercial-NoDerivs Creative Commons licence (BY-NC-ND), version 4.0. It may therefore be circulated, copied and reproduced (with no alteration to the contents), but for educational and research purposes only and always citing its author and provenance. It may not be used commercially. View the terms and conditions of this licence at <http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-ncnd/4.0/legalcode>



Using and copying images are prohibited unless expressly authorised by the owners of the photographs and/or copyright of the works.

© of the texts: Bilboko Arte Ederren Museoa Fundazioa-Fundación Museo de Bellas Artes de Bilbao

Photography credits

- © Album Archivo Fotográfico: figs. 7 and 9
- © Bilboko Arte Ederren Museoa Fundazioa-Fundación Museo de Bellas Artes de Bilbao: figs. 1, 4 and 5
- © Cabildo Catedral de Girona – Todos los derechos reservados: fig. 6
- © Fundació Instituto Amatller de Arte Hispánico. Archivo Mas: figs. 3, 9 and 11
- © Fundación María Cristina Masaveu Peterson, 2014 / Marcos Morilla: fig. 2
- © Museo de Bellas Artes de Asturias: fig. 10
- © Suermondt Ludwig Museum, Aachen: figs. 13 and 14
- © Yale University, 2010. James J. Ross Archive of African Images 1590-1920: fig. 12

Text published in:

Buletina = Boletín = Bulletin. Bilbao : Bilboko Arte Eder Museoa = Museo de Bellas Artes de Bilbao = Bilbao Fine Arts Museum, no. 8, 2014, pp. 47-83.

Sponsor:



metro bilbao

Barely noticed by the critics until now, this interesting Calvary panel [fig. 1], is one of the many significant examples of Catalanian medieval art at the Bilbao Fine Arts Museum. Even today, very little is known for certain about the work, and this lack of information is almost certainly the decisive factor in such chronic neglect. We still do not know the provenance of this portrayal of the Crucifixion nor who painted it, which means classifying it within the frame of Catalanian painting of the later 15th century is no easy task¹.

A fairly small panel (100.6 x 85.6 centimetres, according to Museum records), in its day it must almost certainly have topped the central lane of a presumably medium-sized retable². Structural features like the lateral pinnacles, the rosette crowning the ogee that frames the scene, and the field with plant decoration, suggest that it is an upper compartment. From the iconography, it was probably at the centre, as in the Gothic era the theme frequently occupied the attics of Spanish altarpieces³.

Despite the number of characters, the painting is relatively simple. As is befitting, the Crucified Christ takes centre stage, dividing the painting into two halves; He is flanked by the usual two groups of figures: to the spectator's left, is the Virgin's entourage; to the right, the group headed by St. John the Evangelist. Both are seated at the side of the Cross, following a formula then traditional in Catalanian painting and which had also been hugely popular in 15th-century painting from Valencia since the onset of international Gothic. While it is true that Mary is seated and with her eyes open, like St. John and the holy women that surround her, her posture suggests the fainting spell which is so often seen to affect her at the foot of the Cross. Her left arm hangs loose, and one of the Marys by her side takes her right hand and holds her by the shoulder. Mary Magdalene is clearly portrayed here, with her long hair and red robes, her contorted face expressing a sorrow that is pure caricature, enhanced by the way she pulls at her hair. The Madonna, one or another of the Marys and St. John are arranged in a similar way in several Calvary paintings from Valencia attributed to

1 This essay is part of a series of studies in a research project called "Artistas, patronos y público. Cataluña y el Mediterráneo, siglos XI-XV – *Magistri Cataloniae*" (MICINN HAR2011-23015). My thanks to Javier Viar, director of the Bilbao Fine Arts Museum, for giving me the opportunity to examine this work and for placing at my disposal all the necessary means for the task at hand. I would also like to thank Javier Novo, head of the Collections Department, and José Luis Merino Gorospe, head of the Conservation & Restoration Department, for their help and attention while I was writing this essay.

2 Lasterra 1969, p. 126, cat. 267.

3 Berg-Sobré 1989, p. 76.



1. Circle of the Master of Girona (Ramon Solà II?)
Calvary, c. 1450-1460
Tempera on panel, 100.6 x 85.6 cm
Bilbao Fine Arts Museum
Inv. no. 69/267

Joan Reixac, more or less contemporary to this one; for instance, one apparently from Banyeres de Mariola (Alicante) that belonged to Ramón Aras's Bilbao collection and is at present part of the Masaveu Collection [fig. 2], or the one that crowns the compartment devoted to Mary of the central body of a retable now in private hands⁴.

Clearly featured in these two groups are the thieves, Dismas and Gestas, portrayed in the usual way. They are tied to their *crux comissa*, arms behind the crosspiece, legs apart. To Christ's right, the good thief is young and beardless, while the unrepentant thief sports a beard and looks slightly away from Christ. Behind them is the crowd; some wear turbans and Eastern-style clothing and in the background are the soldiers (or rather their helmets and lances), designed to convey the sensation of a multitude and depth. Often found in Catalonian painting of the time, this device was put to brilliant and quite extreme use in the four lateral compartments of the *Retable of St. George* by Bernat Martorell (Sant Celoni, Barcelona, c. 1400-Barcelona, 1452), now in the Louvre.

Half figures cut from top to bottom stand at the sides of this open, static and serene composition. The panel is a long way from the hectic Calvary paintings produced in Catalonia in the early years of the century by artists like Guerau Gener and Joan Mates. Even the horses usually included in the scene have been left out, although Longinus, the centurion with the lance that pokes out above the Marys, must have been mounted on one. The cast of characters is set in the foreground in a rather anodyne landscape of largely flat, arid ground. Groups of pebbles are visible here and there, as is a path that winds away into the distance, towards a cluster of trees and a castle-like building, the habitual symbolic representation of Jerusalem. The entire scene takes place under a golden sky, dotted with plant motifs in stucco relief and punchmarks.

This particular Calvary arrived at the Bilbao Fine Arts Museum in 1959, when the Museum acquired part of the collection of pre-Old Master art owned by painter and entrepreneur Marian Antoni Espinal i Armengol (Terrassa, Barcelona, 1897-Cunit, Tarragona, 1974)⁵. Included in the lot were twenty-five mediaeval paintings and the purchase, valued at 3,000,000 pesetas, was completed on 17 July when Espinal and Museum director Crisanto de Lasterra signed the sale agreement. The intermediary was Josep Gudiol i Ricart, director of the Institut Amatller d'Art Hispànic in Barcelona, who ensured the hard-pressed Espinal received some sorely-needed ready cash⁶.

The work's arrival at the museum in Bilbao is the final stop on a complex journey, much of which remains shrouded in mystery. According to Chandler R. Post, who published the information in 1938, the work was previously in a private collection in Seville and had been exhibited "in the Seville Exposition of 1929"⁷, i.e. in the *Exposición ibero-americana de Sevilla (Latin American Exposition of Seville)*, held from 9 May 1929 to 21 June 1930⁸. The description of a work featured in the catalogue of the exhibition of pre-Old Master art staged at Seville's Palacio de Bellas Artes (Fine Arts Gallery), in the city's Plaza América, certainly matches the work now in Bilbao. I refer to "La Crucifixión" (catalogue no. 40) displayed in room 10, described as a painting on panel measuring 0.85 by 0.84 metres, featuring gilt backgrounds and small figures, and

4 For the first, concerning other Crucifixions by Reixac, see Gómez Frechina 2001, p. 261, fig. 42.4. On the second, Ruiz 2007, p. 274, fig. 28.

5 Lasterra 1969, p. 126, cat. 267; Galilea 1993, vol. I, p. 373; Galilea 1995a, p. 21, n. 194, fig. p. 27; Galilea 1995b, p. 260.

6 On the acquisition of the Espinal collection, see Galilea 1995a, pp. 20-21; Galilea 1995b, pp. 21-22; and in particular Bassegoda 2013, pp. 53-62, which includes the previous bibliography on Espinal and his collection.

7 Post 1938, p. 375.

8 For the exhibition, see principally Rodríguez Bernal 1994 and Rodríguez Bernal 2006.



2. Joan Reixach
Calvary, c. 1450-1460
Tempera on panel, 106 x 81 cm
Masaveu Collection
Inv. no. FM 410

dated to the 15th or 16th century⁹. The documents accompanying a photograph of this Calvary dated 1930 [fig. 3] would seem to confirm that the panel is the one catalogued as number 40. Although the dating and the length of the work in the catalogue differs from the panel in the Museum, the first problem may simply be a cataloguing error, and the latter a later repair. Today the painting has an addition in the lower part which explains both the change in the work's measurements and the fact that it is now square when it was previously rectangular. I refer to the lower wood base [fig. 4] and the thin lower strip of painting beneath the rise in the ground on which the Cross stands with the aid of a peg. Indeed, the photograph mentioned above shows the work still without this spurious feature and therefore documents the change in measurements from the exhibition catalogue to the work as it is today.

Even more interesting is the fact that the Seville exhibition catalogue also tells us who exhibited the painting: "Sra. Vda. de Gestoso.—Sevilla", the widow of a certain Mr. Gestoso, which is also echoed in the pho-

9 Seville 1930, p. 137, cat. 40.



3. Photograph of the Calvary in the Bilbao Fine Arts Museum, 1930
Arxiu Mas, Institut Amatller d'Art Hispànic, Barcelona
Negative no. C-59619

tograph from the Arxiu Mas. I therefore assume the work belonged at the time to María Daguerre-Dospital y Buisson, widow of one of the leading personalities in cultural circles in Seville in the late 19th and early 20th century, José Gestoso y Pérez (Seville, 1852-1917). Until new information comes to light, I should like to stress for the moment the link between the work and this multi-faceted academician and *connoisseur*. In a eulogy delivered after Gestoso's death, Adolfo Rodríguez Jurado had this to say: "...the residence of our distinguished companion was filled with happiness and art. His house was an authentic museum, mounted with faultless taste, a museum that proclaimed the high cultural interests of its owners"¹⁰. Among other things, this fact alone explains its inclusion in the 1929 exhibition, as Gestoso was one of the five members of the exhibition's first Executive Committee, appointed in 1910¹¹, although his death obviously prevented him from seeing it inaugurated.

Nothing is known, for the moment, about the work's history prior to its time in Seville, although we trust that future research will unearth enough new information to allow us to piece it together. For now, I should just point out that the following name and address are written clearly on one of the labels on the back of the panel: "Sr. Don José Catala Calle/ del Bruch nº 94/ Tienda/ Barcelona" [fig. 5]¹². Whether or not this inscription refers to the antiquary Josep Català, who dealt with the Barcelona Board of Museums in the late 19th and early 20th century remains to be verified¹³.

10 Homenaje al ateneísta... 2005, p. 15. On José Gestoso, see also Enciclopedia universal... 1924, pp. 1512-1513. On relations between Gestoso and Archer Milton Huntington (1870-1955), founder of the Hispanic Society of America, see Socias 2010, pp. 132-135.

11 Rodríguez Bernal 1994, pp. 58-61, esp. p. 59; Rodríguez Bernal 2006, p. 33.

12 Cf. Galilea 1993, vol. I, p. 373; Galilea 1995b, p. 260.

13 On Josep Català's dealings with the Board of Museums, see Boronat 1999, *passim*.



4. Circle of the Master of Girona (Ramon Solà II?)
Calvary, c. 1450-1460
 Bilbao Fine Arts Museum
 Back



5. Circle of the Master of Girona (Ramon Solà II?)
Calvary, c. 1450-1460
 Bilbao Fine Arts Museum
 Label on back

As in so many cases, this particular Calvary was set in the context of Gothic painting in Catalonia by historian Chandler R. Post, who in volume seven of his *A History of Spanish Painting* classified it as attributable to the school of Jaume Huguet (Valls, Tarragona, c. 1412-Barcelona, 1492). Specifically, although with great caution, Post hints that the same artist may well also have painted a panel of the Visitation now in the Museu del Castell in Peralada (Girona), the style of which he found vaguely reminiscent of a painter in the circle of Francesc Solives, apart from certain analogies with Jaume Ferrer, Pere Garcia de Benavarri and painting from Lérida in general. Despite all this, we should remember that Post also noted that he found the Calvary's gold background on stucco relief closer to the ones used by the Master of Girona and his circle¹⁴. Such considerations apart, Crisanto de Lasterra was happy years later to classify the work as being by an anonymous Catalonian painter from the second half of the 15th century, although not without adding that the brilliant colouring recalled the style favoured by Bernat Martorell's circle¹⁵.

Beyond Lasterra's opinion and after the critics' long silence, Josep Gudiol and Santiago Alcolea i Blanch, in developing one of Post's arguments, came down in favour of the work being from Girona. They saw it as a work done under the influence of the Master of Girona, a painter the authors hypothetically identified as Ramon Solà II (documented in Girona and Barcelona between 1456 and 1484)¹⁶. More or less on the same tack, Ana Galilea, who has written about the work on several occasions recently, has catalogued it as a hypothetical work by Ramon Solà II¹⁷.

14 Post 1938, p. 375, fig. 133.

15 Lasterra 1969, p. 126, cat. 267.

16 Gudiol/Alcolea 1986, p. 183, cat. 518, fig. 898.

17 Galilea 1993, vol. I, pp. 373-377; vol. IV, figs. 129 and 129a; Galilea 1995b, pp. 260-263.

The Master of Girona (Ramon Solà II?) and his environment

Since the problem of the Bilbao Fine Arts Museum's Calvary was last addressed in the 1990s, the rather thorny question of art in Girona in the second half of the 15th century has been revisited on several occasions. Despite us not yet having an unassailable link between the documents exhumed and the surviving works, since then our knowledge of the late Mediaeval school has increased considerably. New documents have come to light, and several artistic personalities have been redefined on the basis of the works we know. The result of all this is, as we shall see, a much richer, more plural context for painting, notwithstanding the gaps that remain to be filled.

When he first reviewed the general issue of paintings from Girona in the second half of the 15th century, Post defined two major artistic personalities, the Master of Girona and the Master of Olot, to whom he attributed respectively the two largest surviving stylistic groups of works. The first of these, clearly more relevant and certainly the one that interests us here, revolved around a number of panels kept in the Treasury of Girona Cathedral, namely the main compartment of a retable with St. Benedict and his sister St. Scholastica (TCG 8), a Calvary (TCG 5) and an Annunciation divided into two different panels (TCG 9) [figs. 6-8]. Professor Post reckoned that the artist was a painter active in Girona well into the 15th century, a follower of Jaume Huguet with more knowledge of Flemish painting than was normal in Catalonian painting. From these works, which have traditionally provided the core of the Master's catalogue, Post, swayed by stylistic criteria, also attributed other works to him. One of these was the *Retable of the Joys of the Virgin* from the parish church of Púbol (la Pera, Baix Empordà, Girona), missing since 1936 but known from photographs; he also included four compartments of a predella with St. James, Mary Magdalene, St. Catherine and St. Lucy (at the time, the first two were in a private collection and the other two in the collection of Apolinar Sánchez), a panel with a saint and martyr and a donor, formerly in the Masriera Collection (Barcelona) and a sacrarium today in the Cau Ferrat in Sitges (inv. no. 31543). Finally, with some reservations, Post also attributed other works to the painter, including a panel with St. Anthony of Padua in the Episcopal Museum, Vic (inv. no. 1053), a panel of St. James at the National Museum of Art of Catalonia (inv. no. 64054), another of St. Christopher from Girona Cathedral (Girona Museum of Art, MD310?) and two lateral compartments with scenes from the life of St. Benedict from the collection of the Marchioness of Cornellà¹⁸, in which St. Benedict is portrayed directing work on a church and destroying idols respectively (both in private collections).

The greater part of this heterogeneous catalogue was not submitted to a critical review until almost half a century later, when Josep Gudiol and Santiago Alcolea redefined it in depth¹⁹. Apart from trimming some works from the corpus Post drew up, like the St. Christopher in Girona and the St. Anthony of Padua in Vic, their main contribution was to enlarge the catalogue of works by the Master of Girona, distinguishing the autograph works from those executed with the aid of assistants and those produced under his influence. Among the autographs they arranged the Girona Cathedral paintings mentioned above, the Sacrarium of Sitges, the predella compartments in private hands, together with the central body of an unpublished

18 Post 1938, pp. 376-388, figs. 134-142. Many of Post's suggestions are endorsed in Sutrà 1964. For the monographic study of some works from this catalogue, see Sutrà 1954, Sutrà 1971, and Calzada 1978.

19 Gudiol/Alcolea 1986, pp. 181-183, cats. 507-518, figs. 84, 85 and 880-898.



6. Master of Girona (Ramon Solà II?)
St. Benedict and St. Scholastica, c. 1471-1485
 Tempera on panel, 171 x 112.5 cm
 Treasury, Girona Cathedral
 Inv. no. TCG 8



7. Master of Girona (Ramon Solà II?)
Calvary, c. 1471-1485
 Tempera on panel, 111 x 110 cm
 Treasury, Girona Cathedral
 Inv. no. TCG 5

retable with the Madonna and Child and part of a Calvary [fig. 9], from the Treasury in Girona Cathedral²⁰. In their view, the Marian retable from Púbol and the St. Jamesian panel in the National Museum of Art of Catalonia were painted with the help of collaborators. Finally, the Master's influence was appreciable in a considerable number of works, one of which is the Calvary under discussion here. Others are the panel with the saint and martyr from the old Masriera collection; a Calvary and two panels from a *Retable of St. Bartholomew* from Cruïlles (Baix Empordà, Girona), all now in Girona Museum of Art (inv. no. 134.339 and MD292); a predella compartment with St. Anthony from the church of Vilallobent (Baixa Cerdanya, Girona) and two compartments from another retable, with the *Calling of St. Matthew* and *St. Bartholomew Calming Two Dragons before the Gates of the City of Nadabar*, from the parish church of Sant Martí d'Aravó (Guils de Cerdanya, Baixa Cerdanya, Girona).

Subsequently, both Rosa Alcoy and Francesc Ruiz warned of several as yet unidentified hands at work in the new catalogue of the Master of Girona²¹. Ruiz also attributed a new work to the Master, rightly so in my

²⁰ Ibid, p. 182, cat. 509. Although it isn't made clear, this panel, which was refitted to the *Retable of the Madonna of Bell-ull*, may be the Marian panel held in Girona Cathedral museum that Valero 2008, p. 66 recently referred to. Gudiol and Alcolea i Blanch, for their part, are inclined to the view that the *St. Benedict and St. Scholastica* panel, the Girona Calvary and the two compartments from the Marchioness of Cornellà's collection were originally part of the same retable (p. 182, cat. 508). The measurements of the central compartment (117 x 112.5 cm) and the Calvary (111 x 110 cm) by no means rule out this possibility. Recently, it has also been suggested that the predella panels in private hands (though not the Sitges Sacarium) may come from the same retable (Cornudella 2009, p. 13). My thanks to Joan Piña, technical keeper at the Treasury in Girona Cathedral, for providing me with information on the panels kept there.

²¹ Alcoy 1998, p. 323; Ruiz 2000, pp. 14-15; Ruiz 2003c, p. 56.



8. Master of Girona (Ramon Solà II?)
Diptych of the Annunciation, c. 1471-1485
 Tempera on panel, 174 x 90 cm (each)
 Treasury, Girona Cathedral
 Inv. no. TCG 9

view: a panel of the *Virgin with the Child* in the Fine Arts Museum of Asturias previously attributed to Jaume Huguet [fig. 10]²². The canon of the figure of the Madonna and her face, so very similar to the Virgin's in the Girona Annunciation, are among the more telling arguments in support of the attribution.

Recently there has been a significant shift in the catalogue of the Master of Girona and his circle of influence, brought about by Rafael Cornudella and Joan Valero, working along similar lines although with minor variations. Basing their arguments on style, both have proposed removing part of the output attributed to this anonymous painter; in doing so, they have isolated a clearly differentiated artistic personality, albeit one with evident links to the other.

In Joan Valero's view, the St. Bartholomew panels from Cruïlles, the St. James in the National Museum of Art of Catalonia and the one of the saint and martyr from the Masriera Collection are not the work of the Master of Girona, but by a different painter with his own style, although with features in common with the former. For this reason the author proposed attributing these works to an individualised collaborator within the anonymous Master's workshop or to a different painter who influenced and was in turn influenced by the Master²³.

22 Ruiz 2000, p. 15; Ruiz 2003b, p. 106a, cat. 42. For the panel, see Silva 1988, cat. 3; Pérez Sánchez 1995, cat. 3; Pérez Sánchez 1999, cat. 5. Despite attributing the panel to Huguet and linking it stylistically to other works produced by the Master of Valls, Pilar Silva also noted points of contact with the work of the Master of Girona, associated with Ramon Solà II, although she rejects the possibility of it being his work.

23 Valero 2008, pp. 66-67.



9. Master of Girona (Ramon Solà II?)
Virgin with the Child, c. 1471-1485
 Tempera on panel, 122 x 64 cm
 Treasury, Girona Cathedral
 Inv. no. TCG 4



10. Master of Girona (Ramon Solà II?)
Virgin with the Child, c. 1465-1485
 Tempera on panel, 167 x 89 cm
 Fine Arts Museum, Asturias
 Pedro Masaveu Collection
 Inv. no. 1791

Besides the three works identified by Valero, Rafael Cornudella attributes to the same anonymous painter other panels from the parish church of Cruïlles, probably from the same retable, perhaps the church's high altarpiece: the Calvary in the Girona Museum of Art and three fragments to date unpublished known from photographs of the *Repertorio iconogràfic de Espanya (Iconographic Repertoire of Spain)* (National Museum of Art of Catalonia, Arxiu). With this additional set, most of it from Cruïlles in the Empordà area, Cornudella has created the figure of the Master of Cruïlles²⁴, in a kind of recuperation of the artistic personality which, by the mid-1950s, Gudiol Ricart had defined from the panels of St. Bartholomew there²⁵, later judged to have been painted under the influence of the Master of Girona.

Once we have got the artistic profiles of the Master of Girona and the Master of Cruïlles clear, and singled out two differentiated artistic personalities (though with evident affinities), both claim our attention as leading figures in artistic circles in the Girona of the second half of the 15th century. After excluding the two panels from Cerdanya that Gudiol and Alcolea judged to have been painted under the influence of the Master of Girona, namely the Vilallobent panel and the Guils de Cerdanya panels, we need to bear in mind,

24 Cornudella 2008 and Cornudella 2009. The distinction between the Master of Girona and the Master of Cruïlles is also to be found in Macías/Cornudella 2011, p. 140.

25 Gudiol 1955, pp. 288 and 291. Gudiol attributed the *Retable of St. Cristina* in Corçà (Baix Empordà) to the same artist, although today it is now unanimously attributed to another anonymous artist from Girona, the Master of Olot (MD 290).

finally, that a further work may yet be added to the painter's catalogue. While this essay was being written, Rafael Cornudella informed me of the existence of another retable attributable to the Master of Girona, there being no doubt in my mind that this is indeed so²⁶. This is the main body of a *Retable of St. Quiricus* known from photographs [fig. 11]. Classified as an anonymous work from the third quarter of the 15th century approximately, it was held to come from the Barcelona circle of Bernat Martorell²⁷. Despite this, the physical build of the powerful figures and the outlined profiles fit perfectly with the Master of Girona's output, and the same goes for the way the spaces are formed, although simpler and more reiterative than the spaces to be seen in other paintings by the artist.

From the works attributed to date to the Master of Girona, we may imagine an artist who has assimilated the practices of painters in mid-15th-century Barcelona and, in particular, the artistic vision of Jaume Huguet²⁸. The former's debt to the latter is perhaps best seen when we compare the figure of the Child in the Epiphany of the central compartment of the *Retable of the Constable* (chapel of Santa Ágata in the Royal High Palace, Barcelona) with the lap of the Virgin in the Fine Arts Museum of Asturias, recently attributed to the Master of Girona²⁹. However, as we have already gathered, the painter's figurative culture does not only signpost the Master from Valls. Although the points of contact with the production of Anthoine de Lonhy (active in Burgundy, Barcelona and Piedmont between 1446 and 1480/1490) are, in my view, generic³⁰, some of the Master of Girona's compositions do respond to models used by Bernat Martorell. That this is so is clear from a simple comparison between the Pentecost of the Púbol retable and the one Martorell produced for the high retable of the Barcelona church of Santa Maria del Mar³¹. Beyond what was being done in Barcelona, the vigour of the Flemish models examined by the Master of Girona, which reached their apogee in the landscape of the diptych of the Annunciation, have been used to suggest the possibility of the Master having come into contact with painting from Valencia, the real pacemaker for the adoption of Flemish realism in the lands of the Crown of Aragon³².

Unfortunately, none of the works now attributed to the Master of Girona have been documented conclusively. However, this has not prevented critics, beyond some premature insinuations designed to identify him with the painters Pere or Gabriel Alemany³³, from attributing his powerful artistic personality to one or other of the members of the Solà family, namely Ramon Solà I, his two sons Ramon and Esteve, or his son-in-law Miquel Rovira, husband to Miquela Solà. According to the records, which are all we have to go on (as no known work by any of its members has survived), the family occupied a privileged place in artistic circles in Girona capital and its cultural hinterland in the second half of the 15th century. The family had a role similar to the one played by the brothers-in-law Joan Antigó and Honorat Borrassà during the middle years of the century.

26 My grateful thanks to Rafael Cornudella for telling me of his discovery and giving permission for its publication, and for kindly having placed at my disposal his material on painting in Girona in the 15th century.

27 Gudiol/Alcolea 1986, p. 140, cat. 423. In files at the Photo Library of the Institut Amatller d'Art Hispànic de Barcelona corresponding to photograph G-67472, the work is attributed to the painter Valentí Montoliu and to the Girona school with a question mark, respectively.

28 Concomitances between Huguet and the Master of Girona are discussed in Gudiol/Ainaud 1948, p. 59.

29 Silva 1988, p. 25, cat. 3; Ruiz 2003c, p. 56.

30 On the contacts between the Master of Girona and Anthoine de Lonhy, see Ruiz 2000, pp. 15-16; Ruiz 2003a, p. 106; Ruiz 2003b, p. 333, cat. 42; Ruiz 2003c, p. 55. Valero 2008, p. 68 describes them as "merely circumstantial".

31 Valero 2008, p. 68; Cornudella 2009, pp. 12-13.

32 Cornudella 2009, p. 15.

33 Post suggested this possibility on the basis of the inscriptions in the panel of the Madonna at the Annunciation in Girona Cathedral, which he thought might allude to the surname Alemany. He refers to the letter A on one of the tiles and the inscription "MANA" [sic], which he interpreted as "MANY" when in fact it reads "MARÍA". Despite this, the belief that Pere Alemany was a painter in the Vergosian mould, and therefore different from the Master of Girona, and the fact that the records did not present Pere as a retable painter in the end prevented Post from backing the identification. He preferred instead to create the anonymous Master of Girona. Post 1938, pp. 380-381.



11. Photograph of the *Retable of St. Quiricus*
(c. 1456-1485, present whereabouts unknown)
Arxiu Mas, Institut Amatller d'Art Hispànic, Barcelona
Negative no. G-67472

Early on, Gudiol Ricart thought he could identify Post's Master of Girona as the painter Esteve Solà. Despite the vague notions then held about the clan's artistic profiles, he considered decisive the fact that the works of Girona Cathedral showed, as he saw it, the influence of Jaume Huguet and that Esteve might have worked with this painter since 1467³⁴. However, in his essay on the Cathedral and the Diocesan Museum of Girona, Father Lamberto Font attributed, as a completely unsupported hypothesis, the works of Girona Cathedral to Esteve's father, Ramon Solà I³⁵, a suggestion that was echoed, albeit with some qualification and caution, in later essays³⁶.

Núria de Dalmases and Antoni José abandoned the idea of attributing the works to Ramon Solà senior, preferring to think of them, once again, as attributable to Esteve or, even better, to Esteve or Ramon junior³⁷. As we noted above, after Gudiol and Alcolea most critics tended tentatively to identify the Master of Girona as Ramon Solà II. These art historians based their proposal on the coincidences between the anonymous master's catalogue and Solà's professional career. They pointed to the use of the same fabric modelling technique in the Girona painter's works and in some of Huguet's productions in which they appreciated the presence of collaborators³⁸.

Today we know that Ramon Solà I, who is documented from 1424 and is known to have died in 1462, was already active in the 1420s³⁹. The earliest notice we have of Solà I has him working on several decorative polychromes, something he, like most painters, continued to do throughout his career. However, the documents also mark him out as an important retable painter. In 1433 there are records of his involvement in retables for Torroella de Montgrí (Baix Empordà, Girona) and Vilanna (Besanó, Girona), although, surprisingly, he is not recorded again as doing this kind of work until 1448, when he took part on the high retable altarpiece for Sant Feliu de Guíxols (Baix Empordà, Girona)⁴⁰. From then on, he reappears as one of the key painters of the city of Girona, employed on a considerable number of retables, some of them for the Cathedral. His professional links with his son Ramon Solà II and his son-in-law, Miquel Rovira (recorded in Castelló d'Empúries and Girona between 1453 and 1467) are clear from the surviving contracts for such work. In 1461, a year before his death, Ramon Solà I set up a business with Rovira, who, on his father-in-law's death, had to take

34 Gudiol 1955, p. 288. Indeed, Josep Gudiol and Joan Ainaud had previously noted this possibility: Gudiol/Ainaud 1948, p. 59.

35 Besides the Annunciation panels, Lamberto Font attributed to Ramon Solà I the Crucifixion and the panel of St. Clare [sic], which he believed came from the same retable. Font 1952, p. 47, figs. 92-96. They are also attributed to Ramon Solà in Palol 1955, p. 138.

36 Joan Sutrà contemplated the possibility of the author of the works being Ramon Solà, although he did not reject out of hand Post's attribution to Pere and Gabriel Alemany (Sutrà 1964, p. 43). To begin with, Freixas supported the attribution of the Treasury panels in Girona Cathedral to Ramon Solà I (Freixas 1983, pp. 182 and 185). But he soon attributed them to both Ramón Solàs, father and son, or to the son alone (Freixas 1984, p. 82), and finally, despite attributing the cathedral Calvary to Ramon Solà I, which he assumed came from the same set as the Annunciation panels, he explained that this and other previous attributions lacked a sufficiently solid basis and that, in view of the uncertainty surrounding the Girona issue, they could easily be the work of any of the painters known to be of the Girona school (Freixas 1986, p. 165, cat. 92).

37 Dalmases/José i Pitarch 1984, p. 269.

38 Gudiol/Alcolea 1986, p. 182. Cf. Molina 1994, p. 490, no. 21. This technical similarity was previously noted in Gudiol/Ainaud 1948, pp. 96-97. However, the question is played down in Ruiz 2000, no. 67.

39 For Ramon Solà I, see principally Freixas 1972, p. 60; Freixas 1983, pp. 182-184, docs. LII, LIII, LIV, LV, LVI, LVII, LVIII, LIX, LX, LXII; Freixas 1986; Gudiol/Alcolea 1986, pp. 143 and 181; Prats 1994, p. 457; Ruiz 2000, *passim*; Freixas 2001; Jiménez 2001; Freixas 2003, pp. 76-77; Ruiz 2003b, pp. 102-103, cat. 42; Pujol 2004, pp. 38-39, docs. 44, 76, 77, 79; Ruiz 2005c; Molina 2006b, pp. 38-41; Molina 2008b, pp. 53-54; and Valero 2008.

40 Jiménez 2001, p. 13. To explain the almost twenty-year gap without documented information of Ramon Solà I being hired on any retable, Francesc Ruiz suggested that he might have worked in Joan Antigó and Honorat Borrassà's workshop studio during that time. To support his hypothesis he mentions the fact that the creation of Solà senior's workshop coincides with the disappearance of Antigó and Borrassà; and also to the relation, documented in existing records, with Honorat Borrassà, as well as Ramon Solà I's links with some works associated with these painters, such as the retable at Sant Feliu de Guíxols or the retable at Juià. See Ruiz 2000, p. 13; Ruiz 2003a, p. 102; Ruiz 2003c, p. 55; Ruiz 2005c, pp. 283-284.

responsibility for producing a major group of retables under contract. The working relation between Rovira and the Solà family continued for much of the 1460s⁴¹.

Little is known about Esteve Solà (born in 1444-1445 and on record between 1462 and 1467), beyond the fact that in 1467 he agreed to work in Jaume Huguet's workshop, following in the footsteps of another painter from Girona, Bernat Vicens, who had done the same thing in 1458⁴². The only difference being that in 1463, with his father dead, he had signed up for a two-year apprenticeship with Mateu Alemany of Valencia (documented between 1457 and 1463)⁴³ and that in 1462, now in Barcelona, he had been taken under Narcís Marra's wing to learn the trades of surgeon and barber.

In sharp contrast to Esteve's case, the picture we have of Ramon Solà II is much more complete⁴⁴. As noted above, to begin with we find him associated with his father. The agreements entered into by Ramon Solà I in 1456 to produce the *Retable of the Virgin, St. Cucuphas and St. James* in Fornells de la Selva (Girona) indicate that, if for any reason he was unable to finish the job, his son would have to take over. This association is also clear from the agreements for other commissions of this period, such as the *Retable of St. Peter of Juià* (on record in 1459) and the *Retable of St. Quiricus* in Verges (Baix Empordà, Girona) (documented in 1460 and 1461). After this, like his brother Esteve and Bernat Vicens, Ramon Solà II also moved to Barcelona, where we find him from 1462 on⁴⁵. In 1465 King Peter of Portugal approved a payment of 77 wages for unspecified work in the High Royal Palace in Barcelona⁴⁶. Finally, he appeared in Girona again from the early 1470s, where the records have him working on decorative paintings and retables⁴⁷. Particularly important were the commissions carried out for the Cathedral: in 1472 he painted the keystone of the St. Peter vault on the central nave of the cathedral and in 1484 he was entrusted with the polychrome work on the All Saints' Chapel, work he had already done for the St. Dominic and St. Julian chapel and the Sts. Ben-

41 Miquel Rovira was the son of Barcelona painter Pere Rovira and brother of Pere Joan Rovira, also a painter. Indeed, before coming into contact with the Solà family, he was entrusted with finishing a retable that his brother had agreed to produce, the Joys of the Virgin retable in the church of Santa Eulàlia de Noves, in Garriguella (Alt Empordà, Girona). For further information on Miquel Rovira, see Freixas 1983, pp. 183-185, docs. LIX and LXIII; Gudiol/Alcolea 1986, pp. 143, 165 and 181-182; Ruiz 2000, p. 13; Pujol 2004, pp. 38-39, docs. 60 and 70; Pujol 2005, p. 288. For Pere Joan Rovira, see Pujol 2004, p. 38, docs. 55, 59, 60, 63, 65, 66 and 91; Ruiz 2000, p. 13; Ruiz 2003a, p. 106, no. 35; Ruiz 2003c, p. 55; Pujol 2005, p. 288; Ruiz 2005b; Ruiz 2005c, pp. 284-285. Finally, on the father, Ruiz 2005b refers us to the previous bibliography on the artist.

42 Regarding Bernat Vicens, see note 49. For information on Esteve Solà, see especially Gudiol/Ainaud 1948, pp. 20, 60, 94 and 97; Freixas 1983, p. 362; Gudiol/Alcolea 1986, pp. 181-182; Pujol 1994, p. 65; Ruiz 2000, p. 13; Ruiz 2003c, pp. 53 and 55, no. 24; Pujol 2004, p. 45, doc. 80; Ruiz 2005c; Molina 2006a; and Valero 2008, in particular p. 69.

43 Mateu Alemany is documented as a painter in Castelló d'Empúries and Perpignan between 1457 and 1470. For Alemany, see Durlat 1954, p. 116; Pujol 1994, p. 65; Ruiz 2003c, p. 55, no. 24; Pujol 2004, pp. 44-45, docs. 80 and 85.

44 For Ramon Solà II, see Freixas 1983, pp. 182-185, docs. LII, LVI, LX, LXI and LXII; Gudiol/Alcolea 1986, pp. 181-183, cats. 507-518, figs. 84 and 85, 880-898; Freixas 1997, cat. 30; Victor 1997, pp. 177-179, 183, 185 and 188; Ruiz 2000, pp. 14-16; Ruiz 2003b, pp. 102-103, cat. 42; Ruiz 2003c, p. 55; Pujol 2004, pp. 39, 144, 171-172, 174 and 193, doc. 76; Molina 2006a; Molina 2006b, pp. 38-41; Molina 2008b, pp. 54-56; and Valero 2008.

45 The time Vicens and Esteve Solà spent in Huguet's workshop has been linked to possible similarities between some paintings by the Master of Girona and the work of an assistant appreciated in certain jobs done by the painter from Valls, including the scene of St. Bartholomew in the upper panels of the *Retable of St. Anne, St. Bartholomew and Mary Magdalene* from the church of Sant Martí de Peretgàs, in Sant Celoni (Vallès Oriental, Barcelona) or the figure of St. Bartholomew depicted on the cope in the imposing *Consecration of St. Augustine* (Museu Nacional d'Art de Catalunya, inv. no. 24365-CJT and inv. no. 24140, respectively). Beseran 1993, p. 184, cat. 8; Alcoy/Beseran 1993, p. 38. Also in Alcoy 1998, p. 314, which furthermore points to Huguet's *Holy Sepulchre* in the Louvre as one of the possible starting points for an explanation of the Master of Girona's work. This is echoed in Ruiz 2000, p. 14, and Ruiz 2003a, p. 106. I myself, however, fail to see any truly significant point of contact between these works and the Master of Girona's output.

46 From this, and bearing in mind the professional bond between Bernat Vicens and Esteve Solà and Jaume Huguet, it has been suggested that Ramon Solà II could also have worked with Huguet. At the suggestion of Joan Ainaud, this was echoed in Gudiol/Alcolea 1986, p. 181. On this issue, cf. Valero 2008, p. 68. Other painters in Girona circles being paid for work in the High Royal Palace were Pere Joan Rovira, brother of Miquel Rovira and brother-in-law of Ramon Solà II, and Martí Lluc. See the fairly recent essays by Molina 1991, p. 71; Ruiz 2000, p. 14; Ruiz 2003c, p. 55.

47 One possible link between Ramon Solà II and the world of the miniature, discussed in Ruiz 2000, pp. 15-16 (also in Ruiz 2003c, pp. 55-56 and Ruiz 2005c, pp. 284), is refuted in Valero 2008, p. 69.

edict and Scholastica chapel. For the moment, he is recorded as having produced a *Retable of St. Cristina* commissioned by Salvador Carreres, of Lloret, an altarpiece for the church of Sant Genís de Palafolls (both commissioned in 1477) and the *Retable of St. Mark* for the convent of the Mercè in Girona (1482-1483)⁴⁸.

As things stand, it would still be somewhat premature to put an identity to the Master of Girona; the same applies to most of the leading artists in the Girona area after 1450. We may however agree that this anonymous painter's catalogue appears not to match Ramon Solà I's professional profile, as he was active around the mid-15th century and, therefore, presumably trained in the kind of painting associated with the International Gothic style. Nor do the documentary records and career of Esteve Solà quite fit the magnitude or the provenance of the works in the Master of Girona's catalogue. Indeed, the little we know about Esteve comes from the 1460s and after that he simply disappears from the records. But, on the basis of the available documents, a majority have argued that Ramon Solà II is, for the moment, best placed to occupy the vacant seat, although we would do well to remember recent new findings on artists active in the Girona area in the second half of the 15th century, some of them in close association with the Solà family⁴⁹.

As Gudiol and Alcolea noted in their day, Ramon Solà II's professional career, in terms of dates and places, coupled with the sheer extent of his personal fame, sits well with the work produced by the Master of Girona. Likewise, his time in Barcelona in the 1460s allows us to justify the links the artist has with painting in Barcelona of the mid-15th century, including the work of Martorell, who died in 1452, and Huguet. We should remember that Solà worked in the High Royal Palace in Barcelona at the moment when the Master of Valls was working on the *Retable of the Constable* and that the points of contact between the work of the Master of Girona and Huguet are as clear as those appreciable between the Child of this very Huguetian retable and the panel in the Masaveu Collection.

Ramon Solà II reappeared in Girona Cathedral from the 1470s onward, a timeline compatible with most of the Master of Girona's works associated with the building. We have already seen how at this point he took on the decorative painting for the chapel of Sts. Benedict and Scholastica and, though this does not guarantee he was responsible for the accompanying altarpiece⁵⁰, which is the work of the Master of Girona, it is true that this fact, when added to the other motives we have been discussing, puts him irresistibly in the picture as a leading candidate⁵¹. We also need to take into account the fact that the *Retable of St. Benedict and St. Scholastica* is not the only one that can be associated with Ramon Solà II. The Cathedral's Annunciation has been linked to an item from 1480 in the Book of Works in the Cathedral of Girona, which refers to a payment made to the artist for the "greeting" of the pillar hard by the treasury ("fet e adobat aquella

48 The contract for the Girona *Retable of St. Mark* refers to another group produced previously by the same artist.

49 The roll-call of painters associated in the records with the Solà family is long. Besides Miquel Rovira and Mateu Alemany, the family worked in one way or another with, among others, Bernat Vicens (1456), Frenchman Pere Terri (1458), Miquel Torell (1481) and Martí Lluç. Bernat Vicens, Joan Antigó's nephew, was active in Girona and Barcelona, where he signed a contract to improve his painting skills with Jaume Huguet (1458). For more, see among others Gudiol/Ainaud 1948, pp. 15 and 18; Pujol 1988-1989, p. 252; Pujol 1994, p. 79; Freixas 1983, no. 21, doc. LII, p. 363, pp. 336-337; Gudiol/Alcolea 1986, pp. 143, 162, 164, 165 and 181; Victor 1997, pp. 183-185; Ruiz 2000, pp. 12-13; Ruiz 2003b, p. 99, cat. 42; Ruiz 2003c, pp. 53 and 55; Ruiz 2005c, p. 284; Molina 2006a; and Valero 2008, pp. 69-70. For Miquel Torell, active in Girona and Perpignan between 1471 and 1487, see Durliat 1954, pp. 118-119; Freixas 1984; Gudiol/Alcolea 1986, pp. 183-184, cats. 519-523, figs. 899-903; Ainaud 1990, p. 119; Lacarra 1993, p. 94; Molina 1994, pp. 489-490; Ruiz 2003c, p. 56; Cornudella 2004, p. 162; Pujol 2004, pp. 171-172; Freixas 2006; and Valero 2008, pp. 70-71. On Martí Lluç's participation in work at the High Royal Palace in Barcelona, see note 46. On other issues, such as his contact with Ramon Solà I, see Ruiz 2003a, p. 102; Ruiz 2003c, p. 55; Ruiz 2005c, p. 284. Finally, on Pere Terri, from the Languedoc, see Freixas 1983, p. 185 and doc. LX; Sala 1987, pp. 21-33 and 55-56; Cornudella 2004, p. 162; Valero 2008, p. 64, no.19.

50 Cf. Valero 2008, p. 65.

51 See recently Molina 2006b, p. 40; Molina 2008b, pp. 55-56.

salutació del pilar que est prop de la tresoreria")⁵². We also need to look for any connections between the *Retable of St. Quiricus and St. Julitta* in Verges, associated with Ramon Solà II and his father, and the retable put forward for the catalogue of the Master of Girona in the preceding pages.

A context for the Bilbao Fine Arts Museum Calvary

Having gone through the details of the Master of Girona's catalogue, the link established by Gudiol and Alcolea between the Bilbao Calvary and this painter (and, in consequence, with Girona-based art circles) still seems to me to be admissible, whatever the real provenance of the work. I would just like to add a couple of considerations. One is that the points of contact are closer to the work of the Master of Girona than to the production of the Master of Cruïlles. And, secondly, that, if for the moment, I attribute this Calvary to an artist from the Master of Girona's circle, it is only in an attempt to link it to a known artist with a more or less stable catalogue. It is not my intention, however, to subordinate it to the work of the Master of Girona, among other things because, for the moment, we know nothing about the artistic personality of the author and, therefore, we do not know what contacts there were between the two painters or in what direction they moved.

As Post noted, the stucco foliage reliefs of the Calvary's gold background seem to lead us to an artistic ambience common to certain works in the Master of Girona's catalogue, such as the retable of Púbol or the Sacrarium of Sitges, to give two examples; and we might also point to some formal details, such as the way the haloes of the cross are conceived with reddish rays, in this Crucified Christ and the Calvary in the Treasury of Girona Cathedral and in the Sacrarium.

Such generic links may in turn apply to certain issues regarding the way the characters are conceived. The clothing and some physical types pair up with those of certain characters in the Master of Girona's catalogue. Despite the change in scale, the fainting Virgin (and in some measure the holy women who stand by her) do relate to the holy women of the Calvary in Girona Cathedral and the Virgin of the Sacrarium of Sitges, all of whom are wrapped in the same cloak with ochre-ish inner lining. And the same thing is true, to my mind, of the face in profile of the character in the hat and long tunic on the right of Gestas in respect of the spear-bearing centurion and some of the soldiers from the Girona Crucifixion; or between the features of the thieves, particularly of Gestas, and the character in the turban in the foreground of the panel in which St. Benedict destroys the idols. Finally, we might also add that the face of St. John the Evangelist bears some likeness to the face of the shepherd kneeling before the Madonna in the Nativity scene in the Púbol retable or St. Gabriel's in the Girona Annunciation.

Even so, despite these points of contact, the differences between the Bilbao Calvary and the works of the Master of Girona's catalogue as it stands today prompt me, for the moment, to think they are by two different and yet in some ways associated artists⁵³. The appreciable change in the canon and, in general, the painter's overall concept between this Calvary and the one in the Treasury in Girona Cathedral seems symptomatic in this sense, and may be applied to much of this artist's production. The characters in the Bilbao panel tend to be what we might call calligraphic, being less rotund and having less aplomb than the Master of Girona's

52 This item was published by Joan Sutrà on the basis of a reference unearthed by Jaime Marqués. Sutrà 1964, p. 43. However, he believed it referred to Ramon Solà I, when in fact it refers to Ramon Solà II. Joan Valero has recently stressed the possibility that the reference is to the diptych of the Annunciation in Girona Cathedral, which if correct would mean we do in fact have a documented work by this painter. Valero 2001, p. 228, no. 27; Valero 2008, p. 66. Noticed in Molina 2006b, p. 40; Molina 2008b, pp. 55-56.

53 Cf. Galilea 1995b.



12. Anonymous, Catalonia
Baptism of Christ. St. John the Evangelist on Patmos, c. 1450-1460
 Tempera on panel, 117.8 x 122.9 cm
 Yale University Art Gallery. Donated by Richard M. Hurd, B.A., 1888
 Inv. no. 1928.159

habitually sculptural, profiled characters. Furthermore, these characters are set in an open landscape that has little to do with the landscapes in the Girona Calvary or the one that crowns the *Retable of St. Quiricus*. And much less with the broad, panoramic landscape glimpsed through the windows in the Master of Girona's Annunciation, one of his most Flemish-flavoured works. Nor do we appreciate in the Bilbao Calvary the Master's taste (shared with the Master of Cruilles) for adding relief in stucco to haloes and certain objects.

Indeed, the landscape, the figures and their folds, and other ornamental features, including the haloes, in general place us, to my mind and with all due caution, in a state of painting prior to the one found in the core of the Master of Girona's oeuvre or, at the very least, with a greater link to the artistic practices in vogue in mid-15th-century Catalonia⁵⁴. Without abandoning Girona, I would say that some of the solutions found

54 Cf. Galilea 1993, vol. I, p. 376; Galilea 1995b, p. 260.

in the Calvary bring it closer to the kind of art represented, for instance, by the two surviving panels of the *Retable of St. Michael* from Castelló d'Empúries (Girona Museum of Art, MDG312), painted in the 1440s⁵⁵.

Beyond the formal and stylistic points of contact with painting from Girona, I should also stress the concomitances between the Calvary and surviving parts of a *Retable of the Sts. John* of unknown provenance which, as far as I know, have not been remarked on before. This association was facilitated by a handwritten note on the back of one of the record cards for the Calvary in the photo library at the Institut Amatller d'Art Hispànic in Barcelona, which refers to a "retable of the Saints John of Yale". This surely refers to the two compartments with the *Baptism of Christ* and *St. John the Evangelist on Patmos* in Yale University Art Gallery [fig. 12], which were donated, according to the Museum's records, by one Richard M. Hurd, Bachelor of Arts, in 1888⁵⁶.

However, before looking in a little more detail at the similarities between the Bilbao Calvary and the compartments in the Yale museum, I should point out that there are still two other compartments that I think must have been part of the same retable of the Saints John to which the Yale compartments originally belonged. I refer to two panels in the Suermondt Ludwig Museum in Aachen portraying *The Beheading of St. John the Baptist and the Feast of Herod* and *St. John the Evangelist drinking from the Poisoned Chalice* [figs. 13 and 14], which have been studied in recent years by Francesc Ruiz in connection with painting in Girona in the 15th century. Ruiz has noted a figurative culture common to these panels and two compartments from Puigcerdà dedicated to the Evangelist in the National Museum of Art of Catalonia (inv. nos. 15794 and 24077)⁵⁷. He has also spotted possible points of contact with the paintings of the Master of Girona, identified as Ramon Solà II, and with painting in mid-15th-century Barcelona. In view of his findings, he has hypothetically attributed them to Miquel Rovira and Ramon Solà I's workshop, and associated them with the *Retable of Sts. John* from Foixà⁵⁸ mentioned above. However, for the moment we do not have sufficient arguments either to validate or refute these highly attractive hypotheses.

According to the Stichting Restauratie Atelier Limburg, Maastricht (Netherlands), where *St. John the Evangelist drinking from the Poisoned Chalice* panel is undergoing a restoration work, the support measures 104 x 51 centimetres and its painted surface 81.5 x 46.5 centimetres. And the painted surface of *The Beheading of St. John the Baptist* panel, which was previously restored at Stichting and which no longer has its original support, measures 80 x 45 centimetres⁵⁹. The measurements are entirely in line with the size of the group of two compartments in Yale, which, according to the Museum there are 117.8 x 122.9 centimetres, i.e. around 61 centimetres width each one with additions.

Complementary in both iconography and size, the Yale and Aachen panels are also compatible in the surviving carved features and in the harmony existing between other morphological parts of the paintings, such as the gold stucco reliefs of the backgrounds and the characters' haloes. Finally, we should add into the

55 For further information, see Cornudella 2012, which refers to the previous bibliography on the work.

56 Both compartments were published in Company 1990, p. 98, fig. 47, as part of a predella which combines the influences of painter Valentí Montoliu on the one hand and that of Jacomart and Joan Reixach on the other.

57 These two panels have been attributed to the Second Master of Puigcerdà, hypothetically identified as the painter Pere Escaparra. See Ruiz 2005a, pp. 298-299. The artist responsible for these works has been re-baptised as the Master of Aiguatèbia by Rafael Cornudella, on the basis of the attribution to the same artist of a panel of the Madonna with the Child from Aiguatèbia, in Conflent, in the French part of Catalonia. Macías/Favà/Cornudella 2011, p. 112.

58 Ruiz 1999, p. 128, cat. 33; Ruiz 2003a, pp. 104 and 106, cat. 42; Ruiz 2005c, p. 285.

59 My grateful thanks to Kate Seymour, head of the Education Department at Stichting Restauratie Atelier Limburg, Maastricht, and to her team, composed of Marya Albrecht, Melissa Daugherty and Lieve d'Hont, for providing me with the images of the works, before restoration, and their measurements.



13-14. Anonymous, Catalonia
The Beheading of St. John the Baptist and the Feast of Herod and St. John the Evangelist drinking from the Poisoned Chalice, c. 1450-1460
 Mixed technique on panel
 102.5 x 53 cm; 104 x 51 cm
 Suermondt Ludwig Museum, Aachen, Germany
 (images before restoration)

mix the extraordinary similarity of the styles of the four compartments. The conception of the interiors and exteriors is of a piece, and the figures portrayed in all of them are clearly constructed on an identical model, embodied in characters as close as the two Saints John the Evangelists, who are given central roles in their two scenes, and, to give just one more example, the face of Domitian and the faces of John the Baptist.

In light of the above, I think it reasonable to suggest that the Yale compartments, now joined, were originally the upper compartments of the lateral lanes of the Saints John retable. To the left of the central body, the *Baptism of Christ* would have opened the cycle of the Baptist and the Aachen *The Beheading of St. John the Baptist and the Feast of Herod* would have been on a lower storey. As a *pendant*, on the right-hand side of the set would have been the compartments featuring the Evangelist, i.e. the panels of *St. John the Evangelist on Patmos* and *St. John the Evangelist drinking from the Poisoned Chalice*.

Turning back now to the Bilbao Calvary, it shouldn't take us long to spot the structural links with the four known panels of the *Retable of the Saints John*. Once again the carved parts match up, to the extent that the five compartments all share a rather unusual detail in the small lanceolate leaves that decorate the lower edges of the ogees framing the scenes. And the same may be said of the relief decoration in stucco of the fields of each compartment and of the characters' haloes, which combine a nucleus with punched plant motifs surrounded by two borders: the internal one with punched decoration and the external one with pearly adornments on a black border. This identity can also be seen in the conception of the cross haloes. Finally, the plant decoration of the fields above the ogees of all the top compartments, namely the Yale and Bilbao panels, conform.

I must confess I find the idea of the Bilbao Calvary originally belonging to the *Retable of the Saints John* we know from the Yale and Aachen compartments very attractive, particularly as until now the Calvary has been seen as the only surviving vestige of an unknown retable. The structural connections expounded here make it possible, and the same thing happens if we take into account the fact that the height of the surface with plant decoration around the rosettes in the Calvary must be similar to that of the upper lateral panels; and that their width (83.5 centimetres) is practically double the painted surface of its collaterals.

However, the stylistic identity between the lateral panels of the *Retable of St. John the Baptist and St. John the Evangelist* does not strike me as quite so evident when it comes to a comparison with the work in Bilbao. True, certain features do cohere, including the apparel and its decoration, the conception of the folds and the landscape. Compare, for example, the forms the Evangelist's cape takes as it touches the ground in the figures seated on Golgotha and on Patmos, or the landscape of the Crucifixion and of the Baptism of Christ. However, the faces of the characters, among other things, strike me as being different and the figures of the side compartments denote a greater plasticity and have profiles that are much more fluid. These and other differences prompt me to argue, with all due caution, in favour of the participation in the Calvary of a painter different, although by no means negligible, from the artist responsible for the hagiographic compartments mentioned above, even if there are certain points of contact between the two. In truth, close observation of the five panels seems to suggest differentiated styles of painting.

At the danger of oversimplifying, the Bilbao Calvary takes us back, as I have tried to show above, to the current of Girona-style painting represented by the Master of Girona, perhaps to a state of things prior to the works conserved in the city's Cathedral Treasury. The four panels of the Saints John, on the contrary, are generally imbued with a greater understanding of the new modes of Flemish realism and make a much clearer match with the artistic circles of mid-15th-century Barcelona and Valencia, and in particular with the figurative world of Valencia artist Lluís Dalmau (active in Valencia and Barcelona between 1428 and 1461) and his circle. Although I cannot explore this point further here, the angels on the banks of the Jordan in the Yale *Baptism of Christ* would seem to have a natural affinity with the choir of angels from the superb *Mare de Déu dels Consellers* (Museu Nacional d'Art de Catalunya, inv. no. 15938), just as, for instance, the scene from the Aachen *Miracle of St. John the Evangelist and the Poisoned Chalice* seems to have more in common with the kind of painting defined in compositions such as the panel of the *Beheading of St. Baudilus*, from the high retable at the parish church of Sant Boi de Llobregat (private collection), painted by Dalmau in 1448; or a panel portraying a saintly deacon appearing before the judge, also associated with this master's output and dating from the mid-15th century⁶⁰.

I have no doubt that future contributions will clarify the question of whether the Calvary panel was in fact part of the *Retable of the Saints John*, which would suggest that two painters worked on the same retable, or if the Calvary, and the panels now kept in Germany and the United States, originally belonged to two different works executed by two separate painters, and this despite certain formal and structural similarities. Likewise, we can only hope that time will eliminate many of the doubts and uncertainties that even today, despite our best efforts, still mask the true significance of the equivocal Calvary at the Bilbao Fine Arts Museum.

60 Concerning the painting of Lluís Dalmau and the works mentioned, see Ruiz 2006 and Ruiz 2007.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

Ainaud 1990

Joan Ainaud de Lasarte. *La pintura catalana : de l'esplendor del gòtic al barroc*. Genève : Albert Skira ; Barcelona : Carroggio, 1990.

Alcoy 1998

Rosa Alcoy. "La pintura gòtica", Xavier Barral (ed.). *Pintura antiga i medieval*. Barcelona : L'Isard, 1998, pp. 136-329 (col. Art de Catalunya/Ars Cataloniae, IX).

Alcoy/Beseran 1993

Rosa Alcoy ; Pere Beseran. "Una proposta de reconstrucció per al retaule huguetià de Pertegàs", *Quaderns de Vilaniu : miscel·lània de l'Alt Camp : butlletí de l'Institut d'Estudis Vallencs*, Valls, no. 24, nov. 1993, pp. 35-53.

Bassegoda 2013

Bonaventura Bassegoda. "Marian Espinal (1897-1974) : pintor y coleccionista", *Nuevas contribuciones en torno al mundo del coleccionismo de arte hispánico en los siglos XIX y XX*. Immaculada Socias Batet ; Dimitra Gkozgekou (coords.). Gijón : Trea, 2013, pp. 53-62.

Berg-Sobré 1989

Judith Berg-Sobré. *Behind the altar table : the development of the painted retable in Spain, 1350-1500*. Columbia : University of Missouri Press, 1989.

Beseran 1993

Pere Beseran i Ramon. "Coronaments del retaule de santa Anna, sant Bartomeu i santa Magdalena", *Jaume Huguet : 500 anys*. [Exhibition catalogue and encounter held in Valls on 16, 17 and 18 December 1992]. Barcelona : Generalitat de Catalunya, Departament de Cultura, 1993, pp. 182-184.

Boronat 1999

Maria Josep Boronat i Trill. *La política d'adquisicions de la Junta de Museus, 1890-1923*. Barcelona : Publicacions de l'Abadia de Montserrat, 1999.

Calzada 1978

Josep Calzada y Oliveras. "El desaparegut retaule de Púbol", *Revista de Girona*, Girona, no. 82, 1978, pp. 63-69.

Company 1990

Ximo Company. *La pintura hispanoflamenca*. València : Edicions Alfons el Magnànim, 1990.

Cornudella 2004

Rafael Cornudella i Carré. "El Mestre de la Llotja de Mar de Perpinyà (àlies Mestre de Canapost; àlies Mestre de la Seu d'Urgell)", *Locus Amoenus*, Bellaterra (Barcelona), no. 7, 2004, pp. 137-169.

Cornudella 2008

—. *Un mes, una obra : Calvari de l'església de Santa Eulàlia de Cruïlles, Mestre de Cruïlles*. Girona : Museu d'Art de Girona, 2008.

Cornudella 2009

—. "Calvari (segona meitat s. XV) : Mestre de Cruïlles", *MD'A : Butlletí Informatiu del Museu d'Art de Girona*, Girona, no. 71, 2009, pp. 10-15.

Cornudella 2012

—. "Joan Antigó, Honorat Borrassà i taller. Taules del Retaule de sant Miquel". *Catalunya 1400 : el Gòtic Internacional*. Rafael Cornudella (ed.). Guadaira Macías ; Cèsar Favà (col.). [Exhib. Cat.]. Barcelona : Museu Nacional d'Art de Catalunya, 2012, pp. 228-231.

Dalmases/José i Pitarch 1984

Núria de Dalmases ; Antoni José i Pitarch. *L'art gòtic, s. XIV-XV*. Barcelona : Edicions 62, 1984. (Història de l'Art Català, vol. III).

Durliat 1954

Marcel Durliat. *Arts anciens du Roussillon*. Perpignan : Conseil Général des Pyrénées Orientales, 1954.

Enciclopedia universal... 1924

Enciclopedia universal ilustrada europeo-americana, t. XXV. Barcelona : Hijos de J. Espasa, 1924.

Font 1952

Lamberto Font, Pbro. *Gerona, la catedral y el museo diocesano : estudio descriptivo, repertorio iconográfico, índice explicativo de las ilustraciones*. Gerona : Carlomagno, 1952.

Freixas 1972

Pere Freixas i Camps. "Antoni Canet, maestro mayor de la Seo de Gerona, 1417-1426", *Revista de Girona*, Girona, no. 60, 1972, pp. 50-60.

Freixas 1983

—. *L'art gòtic a Girona : segles XIII-XV*. Girona : Institut d'Estudis Catalans, 1983.

Freixas 1984

—. "El retaule gòtic de Cassà de la Selva", *Quaderns de la Selva*, Santa Coloma de Farners (Girona), no. 1, 1984, pp. 81-86.

Freixas 1986

—. "Ramon Solà. Cat. 92 : Ramon Solà I : La Crucifixió", *Thesaurus. Estudis : l'art als bisbats de Catalunya 1000-1800*. Barcelona : Fundació Caixa de Pensions, 1986, pp. 164-165.

Freixas 1997

—. "Ramon Solà II : Santiago el Mayor", *Cathalonia : arte gòtico en los siglos XIV-XV* [Exhib. Cat., Madrid, Museo del Prado]. Madrid : Ministerio de Educación y Cultura, 1997, pp. 202-205.

Freixas 2003

—. "L'escola de Girona a l'època del retaule de Púbol : Joan Antigó i Honorat Borrassà", Joan Molina Figueras (ed.), *Bernat Martorell i la tardor del gòtic català : el context artístic del retaule de Púbol*. [Exhib. Cat.]. Girona : Museu d'Art de Girona, 2003, pp. 63-77.

Freixas 2006

—. "Miquel Torell, el Mestre d'Olot", Antoni Pladevall i Font (ed.). *L'art gòtic a Catalunya. Pintura III : darreres manifestacions*. Joan Sureda i Pons (ed.). Barcelona : Enciclopèdia Catalana, 2006, pp. 198-199.

Galilea 1993

Ana María Galilea Antón. *Catalogación y estudio de los fondos de pintura española del Museo de Bellas Artes de Bilbao del siglo XIII al XVIII (de 1270 a 1700)*. [PhD thesis]. Zaragoza : Universidad, Facultad de Filosofía y Letras, Departamento de Historia del Arte, 1993.

Galilea 1995a

—. "La colección de pintura española anterior a 1700 en el Museo de Bellas Artes de Bilbao", *Urtekaria 1994 : asterlanak, albistak = Anuario 1994 : estudios, crónicas*, Bilbao, 1995, pp. 7-42.

Galilea 1995b

—. *La pintura gòtica española en el Museo de Bellas Artes de Bilbao : catàlogo*. Bilbao : Museo de Bellas Artes de Bilbao = Bilboko Arte Ederretako Museoa, 1995.

Gómez Frechina 2001

José Gómez Frechina. "Calvario : Joan Reixach", Fernando Benito Doménech ; José Gómez Frechina (eds.). *La clave flamenca en los primitivos valencianos*. [Exhib. Cat., Valencia, Museo de Bellas Artes de Valencia]. Valencia : Generalitat Valenciana, 2001, pp. 258-261.

Gudiol 1955

Josep Gudiol Ricart. *Ars Hispaniae, IX : pintura gòtica*. Madrid : Plus Ultra, 1955.

Gudiol/Ainaud 1948

Josep Gudiol Ricart ; Joan Ainaud de Lasarte. *Huguet*. Barcelona : Instituto Amatller de Arte Hispánico, 1948.

Gudiol/Alcolea 1986

Josep Gudiol ; Santiago Alcolea i Blanch. *Pintura gòtica catalana*. Barcelona : Polígrafa, 1986.

Homenaje al ateneísta... 2005

El homenaje al ateneísta Don José Gestoso Pérez. Sevilla : Ateneo de Sevilla, 2005.

Jiménez 2001

Àngel Jiménez Navarro. "Joan Antigó i Ramon Solà, artistes pintors de Girona, treballaren en el retaule de l'altar major de l'església del monestir de la vila (s. XV)", *L'Arjau : informatiu de l'Arxiu i Museu de Sant Feliu de Guíxols*, Sant Feliu de Guíxols (Girona), no. 41, 2001, pp. 12-14.

Lacarra 1993

M. Carmen Lacarra Ducay. "Els pintors de l'arquebisbe Dalmau de Mur (1431-1456) en terres d'Aragó", *Jaume Huguet : 500 anys*. [Exhibition catalogue and encounter held in Valls on 16, 17 and 18 December 1992]. Barcelona : Generalitat de Catalunya, Departament de Cultura, 1993, pp. 86-97.

Lasterra 1969

Crisanto de Lasterra. *Museo de Bellas Artes de Bilbao : catálogo descriptivo : sección de arte antiguo*. Bilbao : Museo de Bellas Artes de Bilbao, 1969.

Macías/Cornudella 2011

Guadaira Macías ; Rafael Cornudella. "La pintura després de Jan van Eyck", *El Gòtic en las colecciones del MNAC*. Barcelona : Museu Nacional d'Art de Catalunya : Lunwerg, 2011, pp. 119-165.

Macías/Favà/Cornudella 2011

Guadaira Macías ; Cèsar Favà ; Rafael Cornudella. "La pintura del gòtic internacional", *El Gòtic en las colecciones del MNAC*. Barcelona : Museu Nacional d'Art de Catalunya : Lunwerg, 2011, pp. 69-117.

Molina 1991

Joan Molina i Figueras. "Pedro de Portugal y la promoción de las formas artísticas en Barcelona (1464-1466)", *Boletín del Museo e Instituto "Camón Aznar"*, Zaragoza, no. XLIII, 1991, pp. 61-80.

Molina 1994

—. "Relacions i intercanvis artístics entre Girona y el Rosselló a la segona meitat del segle XV", *Annals de l'Institut d'Estudis Gironins*, Girona, vol. XXXIII, 1994, pp. 481-515.

Molina 2006a

—. "Al voltant de Jaume Huguet", Antoni Pladevall i Font ; Joan Sureda i Pons (eds.). *L'art gòtic a Catalunya. Pintura III : darreres manifestacions*. Barcelona : Enciclopèdia Catalana, 2006, pp. 122-146.

Molina 2006b

—. "La catedral del canonge i Bisbe Joan Margarit (1434-1484)", *El bisbe Margarit i la seva època*. [Exhib. Cat., Girona, Fontana d'Or]. Girona : Fundació Caixa Girona, 2006, pp. 29-43.

Molina 2008b

—. "L'horitzó estètic d'un humanista català : Joan Margarit i el triomf dels models septentrionals a la Girona del Quatre-cents", Mariàngela Vilallonga ; Eulàlia Miralles ; David Prats (eds.). *El cardenal Margarit i l'Europa quatrecentista : Actes del Simposi Internacional, Universitat de Girona, 14-17 de novembre de 2006*. Roma : L'Erma di Bretschneider, 2008, pp. 35-60.

Palol 1955

Pere de Palol. *Gerona monumental*. Madrid : Plus Ultra, 1955.

Pérez Sánchez 1995

Alfonso Emilio Pérez Sánchez. "Jaime Huguet : Virgen con el Niño", *Colección Pedro Masaveu : cincuenta obras*. [Exhib. Cat., Oviedo, Museo de Bellas Artes de Asturias]. Oviedo : Principado de Asturias, Consejería de Educación, Cultura, Deportes y Juventud, 1995, pp. 18-19.

Pérez Sánchez 1999

—. "Jaime Huguet : Virgen con el Niño", *Colección Pedro Masaveu : pinturas sobre tabla (ss. XV-XVI)*. [Exhib. Cat.]. Oviedo : Principado de Asturias, Consejería de Cultura : Museo de Bellas Artes de Asturias, 1999, pp. 26-27.

Post 1938

Chandler R. Post. *A history of Spanish painting, vol. VII : the Catalan School in the late middle ages*. Cambridge, Massachusetts : Harvard University Press, 1938.

Prats 1994

Lluís Prats. "El sepulcro de Bernat de Pau, obispo de Girona (1436-1457)", *Annals de l'Institut d'Estudis Gironins*, Girona, vol. XXXIII, 1994, pp. 453-479.

Pujol 1988-1989

Miquel Pujol i Canelles. "El retaule de Sant Miquel de Castelló d'Empúries : descoberta la identitat dels seus autors", *Annals de l'Institut d'Estudis Gironins*, Girona, vol. XXX, 1988-1989, pp. 233-259.

Pujol 1994

—. "El retaule de Sant Miquel de Castelló d'Empúries i la seva circumstància sociocultural", *Annals de l'Institut d'Estudis Empordanesos*, Figueres, no. 27, 1994, pp. 45-79.

Pujol 2004

—. *Pintors i retaules dels segles XIV i XV a l'Empordà*. Figueres : Institut d'Estudis Empordanesos : Diputació de Girona, Patronat Francesc Eiximenis, 2004.

Pujol 2005

—. "Els pintors de l'Empordà", Antoni Pladevall i Font (ed.). *L'art gòtic a Catalunya. Pintura II : el corrent internacional*. Francesc Ruiz i Quesada (coord.). Barcelona : Enciclopèdia Catalana, 2005, pp. 286-289.

Rodríguez Bernal 1994

Eduardo Rodríguez Bernal. *Historia de la Exposición Ibero-Americana de Sevilla de 1929*. Sevilla : Servio de Publicaciones del Ayuntamiento de Sevilla, 1994.

Rodríguez Bernal 2006

—. *Historia de la Exposición Ibero-Americana de Sevilla*. Sevilla : Instituto de la Cultura y las Artes, 2006.

Ruiz 1999

Francesc Ruiz i Quesada. "Maestro di Puigcerdà : il sogno di san Giovanni Evangelista nell'isola di Patmo", Maria Rosa Manote i Clivilles (ed.). *Bagliori del Medioevo : arte romanica e gotica dal Museu Nacional d'Art de Catalunya*. [Exhib. Cat., Rome, Palazzo Ruspoli]. [Milano] : Leonardo Arte, 1999, pp. 128-129.

Ruiz 2000

—. "El retaule de sant Agustí de Jaume Huguet : un referent singular en l'art pictòric català del darrer quatre-cents", *Quaderns de Vilaniu : miscel·lània de l'Alt Camp : Butlletí de l'Institut d'Estudis Vallencs*, Valls, no. 37, 2000, pp. 3-40.

Ruiz 2003a

—. "A l'entorn d'un patrimoni dispers i perdut : els obradors pictòrics gironins del darrer gòtic", Joan Molina Figueras (ed.). *Bernat Martorell i la tardor del gòtic català : el context artístic del retaule de Púbol*. [Exhib. Cat.]. Girona : Museu d'Art de Girona, 2003, pp. 95-108.

Ruiz 2003b

—. "Antoine de Lonhy : retaule de la Mare de Déu, sant Agustí i sant Nicolau de Tolentino", *La pintura gòtica hispanoflamenca : Bartolomé Bermejo i la seva època*. [Exhib. Cat.]. Barcelona : Museu Nacional d'Art de Catalunya ; Bilbao : Museo de Bellas Artes de Bilbao, 2003, pp. 328-333.

Ruiz 2003c

—. "Dalmau, Huguet i Bermejo, tres grans mestres que il·luminen el darrer gòtic català", *La pintura gòtica hispanoflamenca : Bartolomé Bermejo i la seva època*. [Exhib. Cat.]. Barcelona : Museu Nacional d'Art de Catalunya ; Bilbao : Museo de Bellas Artes de Bilbao, 2003, pp. 49-61.

Ruiz 2005a

—. "Pere Escaparra i el Segon Mestre de Puigcerdà", Antoni Pladevall i Font (ed.). *L'art gòtic a Catalunya. Pintura II : el corrent internacional*. Francesc Ruiz i Quesada (coord.). Barcelona : Enciclopèdia Catalana, 2005, pp. 298-299.

Ruiz 2005b

—. "Pere Rovira i algunes obres de la Catalunya Nord", Antoni Pladevall i Font (ed.). *L'art gòtic a Catalunya. Pintura II : el corrent internacional*. Francesc Ruiz i Quesada (coord.). Barcelona : Enciclopèdia Catalana, 2005, pp. 265-267.

Ruiz 2005c

—. "Ramon Solà I", Antoni Pladevall i Font (ed.). *L'art gòtic a Catalunya. Pintura II : el corrent internacional*. Francesc Ruiz i Quesada (coord.). Barcelona : Enciclopèdia Catalana, 2005, pp. 282-285.

Ruiz 2006

—. "Lluís Dalmau", Antoni Pladevall i Font (ed.). *L'art gòtic a Catalunya. Pintura III : darreres manifestacions*. Joan Sureda i Pons (coord.). Barcelona : Enciclopèdia Catalana, 2006, pp. 51-66.

Ruiz 2007

—. "Lluís Dalmau y la influencia del realismo flamenco en Cataluña", Maria del Carmen Lacarra Ducay (coord.). *La pintura gòtica durante el siglo XV en tierras de Aragón y en otros territorios peninsulares*. Zaragoza : Institución "Fernando el Católico", 2007, pp. 243-297.

Sala 1987

Carme Sala i Giralt. *L'Art religiós a la comarca de la Garrotxa : el pre-renaixement, el renaixement, el barroc i el trànsit d'una tendència a l'altra (seg. XV a XVII)*. Olot : [s.n.] (Alzamora Artgràfica), 1987.

Silva 1988

Pilar Silva Maroto. "Jaime Huguet : Virgen con el Niño", *Obras Maestras de la Colección Masaveu*. [Exhib. Cat., Palacio de Villahermosa]. Madrid : Ministerio de Cultura, 1988, pp. 25-27.

Socias 2010

Inmaculada Socias Batet. *La correspondencia entre Isidre Bonsoms Sicart y Archer Milton Huntington : el coleccionismo de libros antiguos y objetos de arte*. Barcelona : Reial Acadèmia de Bones Lletres : Associació de Bibliòfils de Barcelona, 2010.

Sutrà 1954

Joan Sutrà Viñas. "Las tablas de la Anunciación de las Salas Capitulares de Girona", *Vida parroquial*, Figueres, no. 844, 24 December 1954, s.p.

Sutrà 1964

—. "El 'Maestro de Gerona', Ramón Solà (?)", *Revista de Girona*, Girona, no. 28, 1964, pp. 39-43.

Sutrà 1971

—. "Contribución al estudio de los tesoros artísticos del Bajo Ampurdán", *Revista de Girona*, Girona, no. 57, 1971, pp. 32-34.

Valero 2001

Joan Valero Molina. "L'etapa gironina de l'escultor Pere de Santjoan", *Annals de l'Institut d'Estudis Gironins*, Girona, vol. XLII, 2001, pp. 221-236.

Valero 2008

—. "El pintor gironí Ramon Solà II i un retaule dedicat a santa Cristina per a Lloret", *Quaderns de la Selva*, Santa Coloma de Farners (Girona), no. 20, 2008, pp. 61-72.

Victor 1997

Sandrine Victor. "La cathédrale de Gérone durant la maîtrise d'oeuvre de maître Julia 1479-1490", *Lambard : estudis d'art medieval*, Barcelona, no. 10, 1997, pp. 169-196.